Alternative Report on the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Articles 34 and 35) in Kyrgyzstan

ECPAT International

In collaboration with:

Center of Public Opinion Study “El-Pikir”

(Member of the Network of NGOs Fighting against CSEC in Kyrgyzstan, ECPAT Affiliate Member organisation in Kyrgyzstan)

July 2013
## Table of Contents

1. Introduction .................................................. p.3

2. General measures of implementation ...................... p.4

3. Prevention of commercial sexual exploitation of children p.6

4. Prohibition of the manifestations of commercial sexual exploitation of children p.8

5. Protection of the rights of child victims ....................... p.11

6. International assistance and cooperation ..................... p.11
1. Introduction

During its review of the Kyrgyzstan State report on the implementation of the *Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography* in 2007, the Committee on the Rights of the Child urged the government to conduct research and collect data on issues covered by the Protocol. However, since then not much progress has been made in this regard. The UN Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, on her April 2013 visit, noted the lack of statistical data on the extent of commercial sexual exploitation of children in Kyrgyzstan. The lack of statistical data has been a recurring obstacle to the development of adequate government policies aimed at preventing and combating the commercial sexual exploitation of children in Kyrgyzstan. The adoption of policies in the form of a National Plan of Action against sexual violence and exploitation should be prioritised by the government.

Laws that address child prostitution, child pornography and sexual exploitation through the use of information and communication technologies fail to provide children with a strong legal framework. Definitions of offenses are not consistent and some conducts relating to these crimes are not criminalised as per the requirements of the Optional Protocol. However, the government of Kyrgyzstan has recently made efforts to strengthen the legal framework criminalising harmful practices, such as bride kidnappings and forced marriage. With 11,800 forced abductions of women and girls and two thousand kidnapped girls raped every year in Kyrgyzstan¹, these strong legal frameworks are needed. The Criminal Code was amended in January 2013 to increase the punishment for forced marriage to ten years of imprisonment, up from three years previously. This legal reform is a positive response to recommendations made by different States² during the eighth session of the Universal periodic Review (May 2010) on the need for stronger punishments for bride kidnapping. These efforts to combat bride kidnappings and forced marriage must now be translated into specific, well coordinated and implemented policies.

Kyrgyzstan is considered as a source and transit country for victims of trafficking in persons.³ The government has recently strengthened its anti-trafficking initiatives, including the adoption, in January 2013, of a 2013-2016 action plan against human trafficking. The legal framework addressing trafficking in persons is, for the most part, in line with the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children*. Despite this, however, the implementation of this framework has been severely criticised, particularly for the corruption seen in some cases. The involvement of officials in human trafficking cases, for example, may have contributed to a decrease in victim identification and in prosecuting and convicting traffickers in 2012.

With regard to care and protection for child victims, the government, with the support of international organisations and NGOs, has been able to provide support to child victims of trafficking. However, specific services providing care and support for child victims of sexual violence and exploitation are inadequate at present.

---


² Austria, Argentina, Japan and Uruguay.

2. General measures of implementation

2.1 Status of ratification of international legal instruments addressing child protection


However, the government of Kyrgyzstan has not signed or ratified the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure (2011).

**Recommendation:**

The government of Kyrgyzstan should sign and ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure (OPIC).

2.2 National Plan of Action and Coordination

2.2.1 National Plan of Action against commercial sexual exploitation of children

Despite the Committee’s recommendation to establish a specific Plan of Action on the implementation of the OPSC, Kyrgyzstan has not developed specific policies or a plan of action to address the manifestations of commercial sexual exploitation of children.

In 2001, Kyrgyzstan adopted a national plan of action entitled the New Generation State Programme for the Realization of Children’s Rights for the period 2001 – 2010. Due to a shortage of funding, the implementation of the “New Generation” programme has been slow and lacks specific measures to combat the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography.

Some progress had been made by the government with the development of the State Program of Action of Social Partners for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor in the Kyrgyz Republic (2008-2011), which addressed the issue of children involved in prostitution. The Government also adopted child protection plan, Child Protection System Reform National Plan 2009 – 2011. In addition, the Government of Kyrgyzstan recently increased its efforts to combat trafficking in humans by adopting an anti-trafficking action plan (2013-2016) in January 2013.

---

4 Committee on the Rights of the Child, Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 12 (1) of the Optional protocol to the Convention on the rights of the child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography - concluding observations: Kyrgyzstan
http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/crc/docs/co/CRC.C.OPSC.KGZ.CO.1.pdf

However, none of these plans have a specific focus on the commercial sexual exploitation of children.

**Recommendations:**
The government of Kyrgyzstan should adopt a National Plan of Action on sexual violence against children which would include specific measures to address all manifestations of commercial sexual exploitation of children.

The government must allocate sufficient funding to ensure the effective implementation of this National Plan of Action.

### 2.2.2 Coordination of initiatives against commercial sexual exploitation of children

The Commission on Children’s Affairs is the main governmental agency for child protection. Its mandate includes coordinating activities conducted by governmental agencies within the framework of the implementation of the Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography. Despite specific recommendations from the Committee on the Rights of the Child in 2007 highlighting the need for improved coordination and cooperation among OPSC stakeholders, the coordination between government child protection authorities has not improved, leading to a failure in the ability to provide adequate child protection programmes.

However, cooperation between child rights civil society organisations is improving. In 2005, the network to combat commercial sexual exploitation of children in Kyrgyzstan was created. This network is comprised of ten national NGOs, all of whom are affiliated with the ECPAT network.

**Recommendation:**
The Commission on Children’s Affairs for the Government of Kyrgyzstan should include a board of experts who will be responsible for coordinating, monitoring and evaluating all programs and policies related to the implementation of the Optional Protocol on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography.

### 2.2.3 Dissemination and training

Training of local law enforcement personnel on the different manifestations of CSEC has been carried out in cooperation with the Kyrgyz and foreign governments (e.g. Government of Sweden) and international organisations (e.g. OSCE, IOM). For example, OSCE has been training and assisting the Kyrgyz police under the Police Reform Programme. OSCE training includes courses on how to interview victims of trafficking and exploitation as well as victim identification.

---


7 “Foundation Children at Risk”, the public association “Tais Plus”, the foundation “Shining Path”, the “Rehabilitation Centre for Street Children”, the public association “Caring for Rural Children”, women union “Umai-Ene”, the “Centre for Gender Equality”, the Association “Women leaders of Jalal-Abad”, Public Foundation “Ayalzat” and the Centre for Public Opinion Study “El-Pikir”.
Despite the provision of technical training sessions on identifying victims of trafficking in humans, it has been reported that there are not standard procedures in place to guide law enforcement in Kyrgyzstan in the victim identification process. The lack of standard procedures may have contributed to the fact that law enforcers identified fewer victims and investigated and prosecuted fewer suspected trafficking cases in 2012 than in 2011. In total, 11 victims were identified in 2012 versus 38 in 2011.8 The government reported prosecuting ten suspected offenders for trafficking but convicted none in 2012, compared with 13 suspected offenders prosecuted and nine convicted in 20119. The Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography noted, during her visit (April 2013), a failure of the Kyrgyzstan officials to identify child victims of sexual exploitation.

**Recommendation:**
The Government of Kyrgyzstan should prioritise the provision of specific training sessions for law enforcement on techniques to identify child victims of CSEC. The government should monitor and assess law enforcement’s ability to identify child victims.

3. Prevention of commercial sexual exploitation of children

The Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, during her recent visit to Kyrgyzstan (April 2013), commented “the full extent of the sale and sexual exploitation of children in the Kyrgyz Republic remains unknown, due to the clandestine and underground nature of the phenomena”10. Without a better understanding of the magnitude of this phenomenon, the development of adequate prevention strategies remains challenging.

Over the last few years, prevention initiatives in Kyrgyzstan have focused on the issue of trafficking in humans and, in some cases, trafficking in children. The government has not developed any initiatives to prevent child prostitution or child pornography. Education and awareness raising campaigns on the risk of child sexual exploitation through the use of information and communication technologies have not been initiated, despite the fact that the use of such technologies by children and young people is on the rise in Kyrgyzstan.

In 2011, the Center for Public Opinion Research and Forecast “El-Pikir,” with the support of ECPAT International, carried out a round table discussion entitled “Child Pornography and other risks on Internet”. The event allowed relevant stakeholders, including Internet service providers, government agencies and NGOs, to identify ways to counter child pornography on the Internet.11

---


11 The following agencies participated in the round table discussion: the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Education, Department on Children’s Rights of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, State Agency on Communications under the Government, the General Prosecutor’s Office and National Center for Maternal and Child Welfare Ministry of Health; IT operators: Kyrgyztelecom, AK Phone (brand of Fonex), and the Association of Lawyers, public organizations, YPP youth and ECPAT International.
During the roundtable, El-Pikir presented findings and recommendations from a 2011 study, carried out in collaboration with ECPAT International. This study was conducted in order to understand ICT use among children and young people in Kyrgyzstan. According to the study, a large number of websites containing child abuse materials are accessible to the Kyrgyz population. For example, 61% of 100 sites identified as containing pornographic content were also found to host images of child abuse\textsuperscript{12}. Children in Kyrgyzstan are very active online with 75% of those surveyed online daily. Children are active on social networking sites such as Moi Mir, Facebook and Odnoklasskini and many do so without being warned about the risk of online sexual exploitation.

The growing use of mobile devices, including those with Internet access, is of major concern as children in Kyrgyzstan lack awareness of online risks, including grooming and sexual exploitation. This lack of awareness was recently noted with concern by the Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography during her visit to Kyrgyzstan (April 2013).

\textbf{Good-practice example: the ECPAT Youth Partnership Programme in Kyrgyzstan}\textsuperscript{13}

ECPAT’s Global Youth Partnership Programme for Child Survivors and Youth at Risk of Commercial Sexual Exploitation (YPP) acknowledges the important role children and youth can play in the fight against CSEC and encourages their engagement directly in the project as Youth Motivators, Peer Supporters and Youth Advocates. In Kyrgyzstan, the following activities took place from 2009–2012:

\textbf{Photo Gallery:} This project was organised as a “Photo Contest” among YPP youth to expose the marginalisation and vulnerabilities of YPP youth to CSEC around the Bishkek area. Youth received photography training based on the ECPAT youth friendly guide “Six Steps to Improving your Photography” before they went out to take pictures of YPP children, their peers in child residential institutions and children living on the street. Photos were displayed in the corridors of the government house to increase awareness among government officials and also to advocate for greater commitment to child protection among policy makers.

\textbf{Children without Violence:} A 30-second video competition was organised to raise awareness about CSEC issues. Training was provided, using the ECPAT youth-friendly guide “Six Steps to Video Making.” Three winning videos were selected by a panel. Winning videos dealt with child marriage and child sex trafficking and were shown among YPP local partner institutions in Kyrgyzstan. Screenings were followed with discussions with the YPP Peer Supporters. This was a very popular Micro Project among the YPP Youth as it allowed them to use creative mediums to raise awareness about serious issues affecting children in their local communities.

\textbf{Childhood without Violence:} Stop Trafficking in Children: YPP Kyrgyzstan organised an essay competition on the topic of child trafficking and Internet safety, with the participation of 304 children from 15 crises centres (residential institutions for children). The essays were in-depth and highlighted the fact that children were aware of child trafficking happening within their local communities but also exposed a lack of awareness among parents and families about child trafficking and the gaps in legal framework to protect children. The essays were compiled into a booklet and disseminated to all 15 centres.

\textsuperscript{12} ECPAT, Exploring the use of ICTs: vulnerabilities and risks faced by children and youth to commercial sexual exploitation, 2011.

\textsuperscript{13} ECPAT International, Global monitoring status of action against commercial sexual exploitation of children – Kyrgyzstan, 2011. Accessible at: \url{http://www.ecpat.net/EI/index_A4A.asp}
**Comic Book to Raise Awareness about Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation:** YPP Kyrgyzstan also published a comic book about a girl from a small village that was trafficked for sexual purposes. The comic book was designed by children, who also had input into the story line and illustrations. Five hundred copies of the comic book were printed and distributed among child crises centres and schools in different cities in Kyrgyzstan.

**YPP Exhibition Booth at the Non-Profit Fair:** The YPP youth set up a booth to display materials and resources on CSEC in Kyrgyzstan during the non-profit fair of child rights NGOs and other organisations working on social issues. They also hung photos taken by the YPP youth during this event to highlight the experience of children living in the streets and in residential centres and the work done by YPP youth to prevent and protect children from CSEC. Many people visited the YPP booth to learn about CSEC issue and YPP work. Highlights included visits by the Kyrgyz Labour Minister and a local pop singer.

**Training on Career Goals and Youth Employment:** YPP youth organised a series of training seminars to assist vulnerable youth set career goals and to discuss strategies to find work after leaving residential centres. YPP youth felt there was an increased risk to exploitation and trafficking when inadequate job finding and independent living supports were in place.

**Recommendations:**
- Specific research and data collection should be conducted on the different manifestations of CSEC in order to gain a better understanding of the scale of the problem in Kyrgyzstan. Data and research on CSEC is needed to develop adequate prevention strategies.
- The government should prioritise awareness raising initiatives on the risks of sexual exploitation of children online and should collaborate closely with Internet service providers to find technical solutions to reduce such risks.

4. Prohibition of the manifestations of commercial sexual exploitation of children

4.1 Existing legal framework
- Laws addressing child pornography

The 1997 Criminal Code does not contain a comprehensive definition of child pornography nor does it prohibit conducts related to child pornography as required by the Optional Protocol. Article 262 provides for general prohibition on manufacturing, distribution and advertising of pornographic works, images and other items of pornographic nature, as well as trading or possessing these materials with the intent to sell.

Article 157 of the Penal Code criminalises, with imprisonment of up to five years, the involvement of an underage person in activities related to the manufacturing of materials or articles of pornographic nature. It is unclear whether or not simulated sexual acts or representation of the sexual parts of a child for sexual purposes would fall under Article 157.

Virtual child pornography (cartoons, drawings, videogames depicting children engaged in sexual activity) and mere possession of child pornography is not covered under Kyrgyz law. Additionally, existing law does not address the process of soliciting children for sexual purposes (grooming) and there is no law that compels Internet service providers to block illegal child abuse images.
**Recommendation:**
Kyrgyzstan should amend its Criminal Code to add a comprehensive definition of child pornography and create specific prohibitions of child pornography, consistent with Article 2 of the OPSC. The law should also contain a specific provision requiring Internet service providers to block illegal child abuse materials.

- **Laws addressing child prostitution**

Despite the recommendations of the Committee regarding the development of a specific legal framework addressing the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, the Criminal Code still does not contain a comprehensive definition of child prostitution. Article 157 of the Criminal Code criminalises involving a child in prostitution or “performing sexual acts” but does not clearly define what this means. Additionally, the provision does not address compensation or other considerations for children who are exploited through prostitution. In addition, it is not expressly stipulated in the law that victims of child prostitution should be exempt from criminalisation. This issue was highlighted by the Committee on the Rights of the Child in the review of the implementation of the OPSC in 2007.

**Recommendation:**
Kyrgyzstan should prioritise the development of a specific section of the Criminal Code to address child prostitution. The law should clearly define child prostitution and criminalise conducts related to child prostitution, as stipulated in Article 3 of the OPSC. The Penal Code should be amended to contain a specific provision that would expressly stipulate that children involved in prostitution should not be criminalised or penalised.

- **Laws addressing child trafficking for sexual purposes**

The 1997 Criminal Code of the Kyrgyz Republic prohibits trafficking in human beings. Article 124.1 of the Criminal Code provides a definition of human trafficking, consistent with Article 3 of the Trafficking Protocol. Article 124 stipulates that the term “exploitation”, used in the definition of trafficking, covers prostitution and other forms of sexual exploitation. Child trafficking is specifically mentioned and sanctioned with up to 15 to 20 years of imprisonment. It has also been reported that members of law enforcement in Kyrgyzstan were corrupted by traffickers and complicit in human trafficking. These cases were not investigated. Overall, there is a low level of prosecution and conviction of human traffickers in Kyrgyzstan.

**Recommendation:**
Kyrgyzstan should work towards more effective law enforcement procedures. Traffickers should be prosecuted and convicted, especially government officials who are found to be complicit in human trafficking or who have accepted bribes from traffickers.

---

14 Committee on the Rights of the Child, Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 12 (1) of the Optional protocol to the Convention on the rights of the child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography - concluding observations: Kyrgyzstan

http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/crc/docs/co/CRC.C.OPSC.KGZ.CO.1.pdf


http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/2013/210550.htm
• Laws addressing child marriage

Under Article 14 of the Family Code, marriageable age is set at 18 years. However, the commission of family and child support departments can decide to reduce the legal age to marry by one year. Article 13(1) of the Family Code stipulates, “In order to contract a marriage it is necessary for there to be mutual consent of the man and woman entering the marriage, and they need to have attained marriageable age.”

Article 154 of the Criminal Code stipulates that responsibility for forcing and entering into de facto married relations with a person under 17 years of age is punishable by a fine of 100 to 500 standard units or corrective work for a period of up to two years or deprivation of liberty for up to five years. Article 154 (2) and (3) provide for a more severe sentence (deprivation of liberty for three to seven years) for abduction of persons under the age of 17 for the purpose of entering de facto married relations.

Article 155 of the Criminal Code says that forcing a woman to marry or continue with cohabitation, or abduction in order to marry a woman against her will, as well as impeding a woman who wants to get married, is punishable by a fine of 100 to 200 standard units, or deprivation of liberty for up to three years. UNFPA reported that Kyrgyzstan does not enforce the above mentioned laws if minors are forced to marry by their legal representatives. In 2011, the Ministry of Internal Affairs reported 28 criminal cases relating to forced marriage (Article 155), including cases of kidnapping and forced marriage of minor girls.

Recommendations:

Articles 154 and 155 of the criminal Code should be amended to increase the punishment of relatives involved in forcing children to enter into marriage. Kyrgyz law enforcement officials should enforce these legal provisions.

• Territorial and extraterritorial jurisdiction over offenses relating to commercial sexual exploitation of children in travel and tourism.

Article 5 of the Criminal Code establishes territorial jurisdiction over all CSEC related offenses committed by any person in the territory of the Kyrgyz Republic, as required by article 4.1 of the

17 Ibid.
18 Ibid.
19 Ibid.
21 Ibid.
OPSC. Kyrgyz nationals or permanent residents of the Kyrgyz Republic who have allegedly committed CSEC related offenses in a foreign country and who have escaped prosecution in that country can be prosecuted in Kyrgyzstan (extraterritorial jurisdiction). However, Kyrgyzstan does not extradite its nationals to foreign countries for crimes committed abroad and as a result it should make mandatory the “extradite or prosecute” (Aut Dedere Aut Judicare) principle. This principle calls for nationals, who return to Kyrgyzstan after committing CSEC crimes in foreign countries, to be systematically prosecuted in order to ensure these crimes do not go unpunished.

**Recommendation:**
The Criminal Code should be amended to ensure that it is mandatory that the “extradite or prosecute” principle is systematically applied to Kyrgyz nationals who have allegedly committed CSEC offenses in foreign countries, in order to avoid the impunity of such criminals.

5. **Protection of the rights of child victims**

According to UNICEF, support services available to vulnerable children in Kyrgyzstan are focused on trafficking victims. Those services, mainly operated by IOM in cooperation with civil society organisations, provide child victims with shelter support, medical consultations, legal support and professional education. However, such services fail to provide adequate assistance and support to address the specific needs of child victims of commercial sexual exploitation. Additionally, the government did not provide financial assistance to any NGO or organisation offering assistance to victims in 2012.

Institutions for children in Kyrgyzstan do not always comply with appropriate standards of security and such may put vulnerable children at risk of being re-victimised. The Special Rapporteur on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography, during her recent visit to Kyrgyzstan, called on the Kyrgyz government to establish standardised norms for residential institutions.

**Recommendation:**
The government, in collaboration with relevant child protection NGOs, should establish shelters for child victims of commercial sexual exploitation, staffed with trained personnel, able to provide adequate assistance and specific supports to these child victims.

6. **International assistance and cooperation**

The government of Kyrgyzstan took part in several cooperation agreements with other countries from the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) in order to combat human trafficking.

---

These agreements included the CIS Programme of Co-operation to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings for 2007-2010 and the Agreement of the States Parties of the CIS on the Return of Minors to their State of Permanent Residence. However, these cooperation agreements did not focus specifically on manifestations of commercial sexual exploitation of children.

**Recommendation:**
Kyrgyzstan should expand regional cooperation efforts against child trafficking to all forms of commercial sexual exploitation of children.